File Number: SOL-40297-13-RV3



# Order under Section 126 Residential Tenancies Act, 2006

In the matter of:

165 ONTARIO STREET, ST CATHARINES, ON, L2R5K4

Between:

RED STARLIGHT LP

Landlord

and

Refer to attached Schedule 2

**Tenants** 

#### **REVIEW ORDER**

RED STARLIGHT LP (the 'Landlord') applied for an order permitting the rent charged to be increased by more than the guideline for one or more of the rental units in the residential complex (refer to attached Schedule 1).

The Landlord's application was resolved by order SOL-40297-13, issued on October 10, 2014.

The Tenants requested a review of that order.

The Tenant's review request was sent to a hearing and was resolved by order SOL-40297-13-RV, issued January 22, 2016.

The Landlord requested a review of the January 22, 2016 order.

The Landlord's review request was sent to a hearing and was resolved by order SOL-40297-13-RV2, issued on December 14, 2017.

On January 2, 2017, the Tenants filed a second review request asking to review the December 14<sup>th</sup> order.

The Tenants allege that the Vice Chair who heard the Landlord's review request committed a serious error by relying on evidence from a witness who was not credible and that they were prevented from submitting all of their evidence at the second review hearing.

File Number: SOL-40297-13-RV3

#### **Determinations:**

1. The Tenants and the Landlord have each requested and been granted a review of the orders resulting from this proceeding. There have been multiple hearings held.

- 2. Rule 29.17 of the Board's Rules of Practice states that the Board will not consider a further request to review the original order or the review order from the same requestor.
- 3. Rule 29.17 is intended to bring some finality to the proceedings. Otherwise, each party could file unlimited review requests and an application would never be resolved.
- 4. Since the Tenants alleged that they were not given the opportunity to submit all of their evidence and that this amounted to a denial of the most basic principle of natural justice, I considered waiver of Rule 29.17 if there was any indication of a denial of procedural fairness.
- 5. The Board's record of the proceedings does not support the Tenants' allegation. The Tenants had an adequate opportunity to present their evidence throughout this lengthy proceeding.
- 6. During the most recent review hearing, the Landlord and the Tenants had the opportunity to submit written submissions and they also attended an in-person hearing.
- 7. The Board is mandated to conduct matters expeditiously in section 183 of the *Residential Tenancies Act*, 2006, (the 'Act'). In accordance with section 183 of the Act, the parties have had an adequate opportunity to be heard on the issues in this application by way of both written and in-person submissions and evidence.
- 8. The Tenants raised the issue set out in this current review request (the credibility or reliability of the evidence from the Landlord's witness) at the hearing of the Landlord's review request.
- 9. The order mentions this issue in paragraphs 41, 42 and 43. The determinations made by the Vice Chair are reasonable. The order is very detailed and sets out a reasonable basis for the determinations that were made. Reasonable determinations will not be interfered with on review.
- 10. Based on the submissions in the Tenants' review request and the Board's record of the proceedings, I am not satisfied that there is a serious error in the order or that a serious error occurred in the proceedings.
- 11. The Tenants are understandably disappointed with the result of the Landlord's review request since it resulted in an increase in the amount of the above guideline

File Number: SOL-40297-13-RV3

rent increase that was ordered. However, absent a serious error, a review is not an opportunity to reargue your case in hopes of a more favourable outcome.

12. The review request is denied in accordance with Rule 29.11(c) of the Board's Rules of Practice because the grounds for considering a review are not satisfied.

#### It is ordered that:

The request to review Order SOL-40297-13-RV2, issued on December 14, 2017, is denied. The order is confirmed and remains unchanged.

January 5, 2018
Date Issued

Karen Wallace

Vice Chair, Landlord and Tenant Board

Southern-RO 6th Floor, 119 King Street West Hamilton, ON, L8P4Y7 Fax No: 905 - 521 - 7870

If you have any questions about this order, call 416-645-8080 or toll free at 1-888-332-3234.

### 165 ONTARIO STREET, ST CATHARINES, ON, L2R5K4

115	414	709
116	416	711
117	417	712
118	418	714
119	420	715
120	502	716
201	503	717
205	504	718
207	506	719
208	507	801
210	508	802
211	509	803
212	510	804
214	511	806
215	512	807
216	514	809
217	516	810
218	517	811
219	519	814
220	520	815
302	601	816
303	602	817
304	603	818
305	604	819
306	605	820
307	606	901
308	607	902
309	608	903
311	609	904
312	610	905
314	611	906
315	612	907
317	615	908
320	616	909
401	617	910
402	618	911
403	619	912
404	620	914
405	701	915
406	702	916
407	703	918
409	705	919
410	707	920
412	708	

# Schedule 2 - Tenants who are Affected by this Order: File Number: SOL-40297-13-RV3

ACHEAMPONG, VIVIAN ADAM, SMELSER AL HUSAINI, FAROOG AL SHAIBANI, MOHAMMED AMIR, ZAINAB MOHAMED ANAM. FAIZA ANDREW, NAGY ANGLE, VIRGINIA ANIOL, ANGELA ARMSTRONG, JESSICA BARNHARDT, BRENT BAUMBARTNER, ANDREW BENNICI, JESSE BERING, JACOLYNNE BERNICKY, BARBARA BLACKMORE, TREVOR BLAKE, LD BOESE, JAMES BRANSTON, COLLIN BRODGEN, NANCY BROWN, MARK BROWN, MICHELE BROWN, ROSEMARY BROWN, TABITHA BURKE, JESSIE BURNS, ASHLEY CAIN, MARGARET CAMPBELL, BARBARA CAPASSO, JOSEPH CECCHI. JORDAN MICHAEL COOK, DEBORAH CORBI, AMANDA COURCHESNE, NANCY COUSINS, JANE CRUISE, HOLLY CSUKA, WILLIAM CUMMING, STEVEN DERTINGER, NICHOLAS DIEUZ, CAROL DRESSEL, CAROLYN ANN DUGUAY, ADAM DUVAL, CATHIE DZUIBANOWSKI, MAURICE EATON, CLAYTON EDELMAN, MARIA ELZOWAWI, ALHUSSEIN

FEATHER, JANICE FISHER, KARLI FITZGIBBON, MARY JO FLEMING, WM MACRIS FORTIN, DONNA FRANCIS, ASHTONNE GORING FREDERICK, ALEX FREEMAN, SHAWN GALLOWAY, SUSAN GARCIA, MAYELAYNE GORING, KERRY GREEN, CHARLES HABTOM, FEVEN HEBERT, BERTRAND HERSTEK, BENNY HIGNETT, DAVIS HOUDE, JOANNE HOUSING, NIAGARA REGIONAL HURSON, DEBORAH JACQUES, KENNETH JASINSKI, STEVEN JOHNSON, BRANDEN JOHNSTON, LYNDA JONES, JUSTYN KARLOVA, ANNA KOSTROMA, VLADIMIR KRAVCIK, STEPHANIE KRIKUN, DARIA LAI, STANFORD LANCASTER, TIM LARSEN, SIMONE LEE, STEVEN LI, MENGXUE LIN, LIANG MACDONALD, JANET MADOLE, DON MAHLE, LAURIE MALANGIS, JOCELYN MASON, LINDA MCCOURT, KENDRA MCFADDEN, SEAN MCLAUGHLIN, DIANNE MCNABB, RANDY MELLEN, KENNETH MIAN, JAVID MOATE, JAMES

## Schedule 2 - Tenants who are Affected by this Order: File Number:SOL-40297-13-RV3

MULVIHILL, ERIN MURPHY, KARI MURPHY, MAXINE NEIRA, MERCEDES NESBITT, LAURA NICKERSON, RUBY PENNER, MARY PETCH, DEBORAH PETTIPAS, KATHY LYNN PIETIKAINE, ERIKKI PRENTICE, ROB RAGOONATH, FATIMA ALYSSA REDDICK, RONNIE REID, DANIELLE REID, DARREN ROMEIKO, DEBBIE RYAN, SYLVIA SAAD, MOHAMED ABUEL SALIU, MYSLIM SAWATSKY, MARLENE

SEGUIN, ROANNE SMITH, MARTIN SPECIAINY, GERALD STAVROU, PETER SWEENEY, JOHN TAYLOR, BETTY THOMPSON, DIANE THOMPSON, THEODORE TRIPP, DIANE VANDERVAART, JULIE VILBRUN, STALL VON BORMANN, NIKI WEISS, ROBIN WITTIW, STELLA WOLBERT, KEVIN XHEMALI, BEXHET YI, ZHAN YOUNG, RAMONA YU, FANG ZHU, HAI